

From: Duane Thresher <[dethresher@alaska.edu](mailto:dethresher@alaska.edu)>  
Date: April 18, 2013 5:00:33 PM MDT  
To: [epic@awi.de](mailto:epic@awi.de)  
Subject: Citation fraud

AWI:

There seems to be fraud at

<http://epic.awi.de/20468/>

The article title given there is

What caused the mid-Holocene forest decline on the eastern Tibet-Qinghai Plateau?

The real article title at the link given there, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1466-8238.2009.00501.x>, is:

THIS ARTICLE HAS BEEN RETRACTED: What caused the mid-Holocene forest decline on the eastern Tibet-Qinghai Plateau?

This same fraud exists in the 2010 section of

<http://www.paleodyn.net/publications.html>

reached from the Publications link on the AWI site

<https://web-apps.awi.de/CurriculumVitae/glohmann.html>

I will have to make this public and pursue it with higher authorities.

Dr. Duane Thresher

From: Duane Thresher <[dethresher@alaska.edu](mailto:dethresher@alaska.edu)>  
Date: April 19, 2013 10:03:21 PM MDT  
To: [Hans-Wolfgang.Hubberten@awi.de](mailto:Hans-Wolfgang.Hubberten@awi.de), [Karin.Lochte@awi.de](mailto:Karin.Lochte@awi.de), [Peter.Lemke@awi.de](mailto:Peter.Lemke@awi.de),  
[Ralf.Tiedemann@awi.de](mailto:Ralf.Tiedemann@awi.de), [Heike.Wolke@awi.de](mailto:Heike.Wolke@awi.de)  
Subject: Lohmann and Herzs Schuh citation fraud

This is to inform you of serious academic misconduct, specifically citation fraud, by two AWI researchers, Gerrit Lohmann and Ulrike Herzs Schuh.

This retracted article by Herzs Schuh and Lohmann

Herzs Schuh, U., Birks, H. J. B., Liu, X., Kubatzki, C. and Lohmann, G. (2010), THIS ARTICLE HAS BEEN RETRACTED: What caused the mid-Holocene forest decline on the eastern Tibet-Qinghai Plateau?. *Global Ecology and Biogeography*, 19: 278–286. doi: 10.1111/j.1466-8238.2009.00501.x

<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1466-8238.2009.00501.x/citedby>

was retracted in Dec 2010. But from then until present it has been cited, with intent to deceive, in their new articles and publication lists with the retraction part omitted, pretending to be a legitimate article.

You can see in the Cited By list of the above link the articles where this retracted article has been cited like this up to 2013. These journals have been notified of this citation fraud.

More directly for AWI and just as examples, this citation fraud exists at

<http://epic.awi.de/20468/>

which is linked to variously on the AWI website. Further, this citation fraud exists in the 2010 section of

<http://www.paleodyn.net/publications.html>

which is current to 2013 and reached from the Publications link on the AWI site

<https://web-apps.awi.de/CurriculumVitae/glohmann.html>

Note that most of the references in <http://www.paleodyn.net/publications.html> have links to the original articles but this fraudulent reference does not, purposely making it hard to check.

This citation fraud can not believably be dismissed as forgetfulness. A retracted article is extremely career-damaging and any repentant perpetrator would actively seek to remove any mention of it.

I reported this citation fraud to [epic@awi.de](mailto:epic@awi.de) (see email below) so Lohmann and Herzschuh may have been informed (and you may not have been) and tried to change the evidence. I thus attach dated printouts of the mentioned AWI-related sites: ePIC\_CitationFraud\_18Apr2013.pdf and PublicationsGerritLohmann\_18Apr2013.pdf.

Among others, this citation fraud is being reported to the DFG, Helmholtz, Retraction Watch (where the retracted article was reported), and Der Spiegel, which has an interest in such news:

<http://www.spiegel.de/unispiegel/studium/forschungsskandal-staatsanwaltschaft-ermittelt-gegen-goettinger-uni-mitarbeiter-a-627003.html>

<http://www.spiegel.de/spiegel/print/d-67768141.html>

There is no point in threatening or attacking me or those around me. This information is already public. And I will report any such threats/attacks.

Dr. Duane Thresher

From: Duane Thresher <[dethresher@alaska.edu](mailto:dethresher@alaska.edu)>  
Date: April 22, 2013 3:09:47 PM PDT  
To: [Hans-Wolfgang.Hubberten@awi.de](mailto:Hans-Wolfgang.Hubberten@awi.de), [Karin.Lochte@awi.de](mailto:Karin.Lochte@awi.de), [Peter.Lemke@awi.de](mailto:Peter.Lemke@awi.de),  
[Ralf.Tiedemann@awi.de](mailto:Ralf.Tiedemann@awi.de), [Heike.Wolke@awi.de](mailto:Heike.Wolke@awi.de)  
Subject: Re: Lohmann and Herzschuh citation fraud

I see that on [www.paleodyn.net/publications.html](http://www.paleodyn.net/publications.html) a tiny little "retracted" has been added today in parentheses.

First, this is still citation fraud since the official title for the article, as given by How to Cite on <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1466-8238.2009.00501.x/citedby>, is:

Herzschuh, U., Birks, H. J. B., Liu, X., Kubatzki, C. and Lohmann, G. (2010), THIS ARTICLE HAS BEEN RETRACTED: What caused the mid-Holocene forest decline on the eastern Tibet-Qinghai Plateau?. *Global Ecology and Biogeography*, 19: 278–286. doi: 10.1111/j.1466-8238.2009.00501.x

Note the all-caps RETRACTED part that is part of the official title. Of course a link to the retracted article on [www.paleodyn.net/publications.html](http://www.paleodyn.net/publications.html) was still not provided, unlike almost all of the other articles there (except one nearby to make it look like all articles do not have one).

Second, if you are going to try a coverup instead of being ethical you will need someone who actually knows about the intricacies of the Internet. For example, I am reporting the following link along with [www.paleodyn.net/publications.html](http://www.paleodyn.net/publications.html)

[http://webcache.googleusercontent.com/search?safe=off&output=search&client=psy-ab&q=cache%3Awww.paleodyn.net%2Fpublications.html&oq=cache%3Awww.paleodyn.net%2Fpublications.html&gs\\_l=hp.3...18836.27530.1.28098.20.17.2.0.0.0.331.2340.6j8j1j2.17.0...0.0...1c.1.9.hp.HCDtVeh\\_Lww&psj=1](http://webcache.googleusercontent.com/search?safe=off&output=search&client=psy-ab&q=cache%3Awww.paleodyn.net%2Fpublications.html&oq=cache%3Awww.paleodyn.net%2Fpublications.html&gs_l=hp.3...18836.27530.1.28098.20.17.2.0.0.0.331.2340.6j8j1j2.17.0...0.0...1c.1.9.hp.HCDtVeh_Lww&psj=1)

See attached GoogleCache\_PublicationsGerritLohmann\_12Apr2013.pdf. This is besides the dated printout of [www.paleodyn.net/publications.html](http://www.paleodyn.net/publications.html) that you also got.

Third, I see that the AWI site <https://web-apps.awi.de/CurriculumVitae/glohmann.html> from whence [www.paleodyn.net/publications.html](http://www.paleodyn.net/publications.html) used to be reached is no longer available today. One AWI link to that site removed, many to go...

Fourth, the most important part of the reporting is not the online evidence but the demand that Lohmann's publication list be reviewed for citation fraud in all proposals and grants he submitted to funding agencies, for which there is plenty of probable cause. Trying to cover up the online evidence now, especially so badly, is akin to a confession. I have evidence for other earlier proposal/grant fraud and this is being reported as well.

Again, this citation fraud can not believably be dismissed as forgetfulness. A retracted article is extremely career-damaging and any repentant perpetrator would actively seek to remove any mention of it. Moreover, even real such forgetfulness would be extreme negligence.

Dr. Duane Thresher